



Global Encounters European Identities / edited by Mary N. Harris with Anna Agnarsdóttir and Csaba Lévai. - Pisa : Plus-Pisa University Press, 2010. – (Thematic work group. 6, Europe and the Wider World ; 5)

940 (21.)

1. Europa – Cultura 2. Europa - Storia I. Harris, Mary N. II. Lévai, Csaba



CIP a cura del Sistema bibliotecario dell'Università di Pisa

This volume is published thanks to the support of the Directorate General for Research of the European Commission, by the Sixth Framework Network of Excellence CLIOHRES.net under the contract CIT3-CT-2005-006164.

The volume is solely the responsibility of the Network and the authors; the European Community cannot be held responsible for its contents or for any use which may be made of it.

Cover: Anonymous, *Dance of Amerindians*, 18th century, painted screen, Museo de America, Madrid  
©Photo Scala, Florence

© 2010 by CLIOHRES.net

The materials published as part of the CLIOHRES Project are the property of the CLIOHRES.net Consortium.

They are available for study and use, provided that the source is clearly acknowledged.

cliohres@cliohres.net - www.clioehres.net

Published by Edizioni Plus – Pisa University Press

Lungarno Pacinotti, 43

56126 Pisa

Tel. 050 2212056 – Fax 050 2212945

info.plus@adm.unipi.it

www.edizioniplus.it - Section "Biblioteca"

Member of



Association of American  
University Presses

ISBN: 978-88-8492-738-5

Editorial assistance

Viktoriya Kolp

Informatic editing

Răzvan Adrian Marinescu

# An Embarrassing Legacy and a Booty of Luxury: Christian Attitudes towards Islamic Art and Architecture in the Medieval Kingdom of Valencia

AMADEO SERRA DESFILIS  
University of Valencia

## ABSTRACT

This chapter examines the relationship between Islam and Christianity in medieval Spain as far as art and architecture are concerned, bearing in mind the length and variability of cross-cultural contact in this historical territory. Christian attitudes towards Islamic art and architecture are interpreted as a peculiar blend of admiration, reactive adaptation, rivalry, emulation and positive transfer of knowledge between two cultures living together in medieval Iberia for eight centuries. In the light of recent research, the role of art and architecture in the process of self-differentiation and self-adscription within both communities must be reconsidered. An imaginary boundary appeared between the two societies, regulating social life and, therefore, conditioning attitudes about objects, buildings and their uses, but this never prevented cultural or technical exchange. From the study of the art and architecture in the kingdom of Valencia (1232-1500), we have come to the conclusion that ethnic and religious differences were not the most relevant factors in the filtering of artistic exchange and assigning new functions to forms, objects or techniques. Finally, the chapter analyses how Spanish historiography has developed narratives, including the appropriation of the Islamic legacy, to construct a national identity in modern times.

*El presente artículo estudia la relación entre el Islam y la Cristiandad en la España medieval en el ámbito del arte y la arquitectura, considerando la duración y variabilidad del contacto cultural en este territorio histórico. Las actitudes cristianas hacia el arte islámico y la arquitectura se interpretan como una peculiar mezcla de admiración, adaptación reactiva, rivalidad, emulación y transferencia de conocimiento entre dos culturas que coexistieron en la península Ibérica durante ocho siglos. El papel del arte y la arquitectura en el proceso de diferenciación e identificación de ambas comunidades tiene que ser reconsiderado a la luz de la investigación más reciente. Aunque un límite imaginario fue interiorizándose tanto*

*en la psicología de los individuos como en las normas que regulaban la vida social y, por lo tanto, condicionó las actitudes hacia los objetos, los edificios y los usos de unos y otros, nunca evitó el intercambio cultural y técnico entre ambas sociedades. El rechazo, los nuevos usos o la asimilación de objetos y formas del mundo islámico revistieron distintas modalidades cuyas motivaciones conviene esclarecer. Del estudio de algunos casos, en particular del antiguo reino de Valencia (1232-1500), deriva la conclusión de que las diferencias religiosas o étnicas no fueron los factores más importantes a la hora de filtrar el intercambio artístico y de asignar nuevas funciones a las formas, los objetos o las técnicas. Finalmente, se presta cierta atención al modo en que la historiografía española ha integrado el legado islámico en la construcción de la identidad nacional en época moderna.*

## INTRODUCTION

It is increasingly evident that Islam was one of the main heirs of late Antiquity and that, particularly from the 10th century onwards, Islamic art was highly diverse. It was also subject to processes of change and adaptation, much in the manner of Western (Christian) art and, on occasions, caused by contact with it<sup>1</sup>. Encounters between Islam and Christian worlds are often framed by traditional religious, ethnic and linguistic boundaries that do not take cultural exchange into account and admittedly ignore the contributions of other minority communities, such as the Jews<sup>2</sup>.

The *Reconquista* [the act of re-conquest, but also the process of 'restoring' Christian dominion in Spain] and *convivencia* [living together] are words also used by non-Spanish historians to refer to an enduring interface between the Christian kingdoms and Al-Andalus [Islamic Spain] during the Middle Ages<sup>3</sup>. These concepts go some way towards understanding cross-cultural relations from the Islamic invasion of the Iberian Peninsula in the 8th century to the Christian conquest of the Nasrid kingdom of Granada in 1492. However, they are somewhat simplistic and are also burdened with historiographical and nationalistic connotations from the times of Américo Castro and Claudio Sánchez Albornoz<sup>4</sup>.

The length and variability of cultural contact and the consequences it had in Spain, even after 1492, are highly complex and thus deserve close examination. Defining limits in time and space, we intend to concentrate on the kingdom of Valencia between the Christian conquest (circa 1232-1245) and forced conversion in 1521, as a result of the longstanding cultural relations between Christian and Muslim communities, until the final expulsion of the *Moriscos* [Muslims who were forced to convert to Christianity but often secretly continued to practise Islam] in 1609<sup>5</sup>.

This study reconsiders some artistic issues in order to interpret Christian attitudes towards Islamic art and architecture as a peculiar mixture of admiration, reactive adaptation, rivalry, emulation and positive transfer of knowledge between two cultures living

together in medieval Spain. Certainly, there was stimulus towards diffusion across a barrier which resembled an imaginary boundary separating two coexisting cultures in a world of mixed and fluid identities rather than an actual border. However, Christian Spaniards' fear, it has been said, "became internalised both in individual psychologies and in collective norms regulating social distance among religious groups", which were "institutionalised in discriminatory laws and apparatus for enforcing them"<sup>6</sup>. It is important then to know to what extent exchanges across this boundary reflect conscious shifts in cultural and political values.

The role of art and architecture in the process of cultural differentiation and self-description within either the Christian or Islamic community must also be explored far beyond the mere appreciation of *Mudejar* art as the result of the influence of Islamic art and architecture on Christian kingdoms in Spain<sup>7</sup>. Muslims who remained after the Christian advance from north to south were called *Mudejares*, literally "those who are permitted to remain". Recent studies suggest that Mudejar art developed as an Islamic influence on Christian art but they also remind us that its historic place in the process of the continuous transformation of identity among Christians, Muslims and Jews for many centuries should be defined. The boundary moved following the southbound advance of the Christian Reconquest, but different contexts and cultural and political agendas resulted in several ways of appropriation, reuse and dismissal of Islamic traditions<sup>8</sup>. It has been noted that the kingdom of Valencia was not a promised land for Mudejar art, with the remarkable exception of pottery, despite the immersion of Christian settlers "in a sea of Muslims, clustered in city atolls or more often scattered adrift" in Burns's words<sup>9</sup>. Since Jews probably played a pivotal role in the process of cultural exchange, their artistic choices may go towards illustrating the acculturation process facing Muslims and Christians in medieval Spain<sup>10</sup>. The synagogue of Santa Maria la Blanca in Toledo bears witness to the influence and permeable boundaries between Muslim and Jewish communities and was later transformed into a Christian church while the synagogue of Samuel Halevi (circa 1360) echoes the Castilian court style with its Nasrid stucco ornaments and Arabic inscriptions<sup>11</sup>. Jews, who were shifting cultural referents, either by conversion or migration, were likely both to be receptive to cultural stimuli from different origins and to be able to assess the market for cultural innovation in the host society<sup>12</sup>. *Mozarabs*, namely Christians faithful to their religion under Islamic rule, may have played an analogous role, although we know less about the extent of their cultural transmission, especially when they migrated to the Christian north. Nonetheless, these issues have been taken into account by historians of art and architecture studying early medieval Spain. The current view is that Mozarabic art is the result of the acculturation process among Christians living under Islamic rule. However, Mozarabs are no longer considered the sole source of Islamic aesthetic values since a shared artistic culture existed north and south of the border of the river Duero, in spite of religious differences<sup>13</sup>.

To a great extent, Islamic civilisation was the first heir of the Classical legacy in the early middle ages. Cultural interaction between Muslims and Christians had the result of effectively transmitting ancient knowledge, science and technology<sup>14</sup>. In the early Middle Ages, a movement of technological diffusion followed a trajectory from China and India to the West, passing through Persia, which was also a centre of technological innovation. Architecture and artistic crafts are two fields in which transfer of knowledge has been discussed with view to determining the Roman, Islamic or Christian origins of certain ornamental styles, building techniques or particular craft traditions.

According to Glick, easy access to Andalusian craft products in Christian Spain may have retarded the development of local industries and inhibited the migration of technical specialists, at least until the late 11th century, when the situation of economic dependence began to change. To enhance the development of crafts associated with Islamic expertise, Muslim artisans, and particularly those whose crafts were deemed to be Islamic specialities, were sought and invited to remain under Christian rule. Christian kings and lords enticed groups of Muslim workers to settle elsewhere to develop particular industries such as lusterware, pottery or silk textiles. In his new kingdom of Valencia, James I of Aragon (1209-1276) encouraged the continuity of crafts and the social groups managing and serving them. James I fostered the paper industry in Xàtiva and protected it from competition by forbidding Muslims elsewhere in the kingdom of Valencia to make paper<sup>15</sup>. Continuity in other crafts was achieved through less formal mechanisms: skilled Muslim artisans remained as long as there was a good market for their wares<sup>16</sup>, but Christians soon came to control the production, transport and retail sectors when the profits were attractive enough. A skilled artisan must have embroidered in gold the luxury vestments in the Order of the Temple's chapel in Peniscola (Castellón) requisitioned by James II on the Order's suppression, but even if the sumptuous cloths are described as "Saracen work with Arab letters in brilliant colours", this does not necessarily imply that they were made by Islamic hands<sup>17</sup>.

The case of lusterware pottery is illustrative. This is a special type of ceramics with a metallic glaze that gives the effect of iridescence, produced by metallic oxides with a shiny finish painted over the glaze (in what is known as "lustre"), which is given a second firing at a lower temperature in a reduction kiln, which excludes oxygen. This extremely complex pottery technique originated in the Abbasid caliphate in the 8th-9th centuries, and soon became widespread in Persia and Egypt. Lusterware was later produced in Egypt during the Fatimid caliphate in the 10th-12th centuries and reached Malaga and some other centres in the Iberian Peninsula and Balearic Islands while production continued in the Middle East. Lusterware pieces were appreciated by Muslims and Christians as a substitute for more luxurious gold and silverware and not only because it was less morally suspicious in orthodox Muslim eyes. It was certainly less expensive than gold and silver plates, it offered its users a painterly design on a smooth glassy glaze and the technical refinement of these ceramics was appreciated by connoisseurs. The

technology, involving a multi-staged and highly sophisticated process (each piece had to be baked three times and special kilns were required), was consciously transferred to Calatayud and Teruel in Aragon, Manises and Paterna in Valencia and to Majorca, whence it was taken to Italy and adapted under the name of *maiolica*. The conquest of Muslim territories and the forced transfer of Muslim potters to Christian cities was admittedly the main cause of the extension in these of the use of *maiolica*. Technology remained in Islamic hands for some time but the trade and distribution of this special craft attested to the rivalry between centres such as Valencia and Majorca under Christian rule and the Muslim kingdom of Granada until 1492. The artisans were Muslims but they had to adapt to a new market with different tastes and demands, though they continued to use an Islamic repertoire, including inscriptions such as the *alafia* ("God is the only god"), geometrical patterns, stars, stylised flowers and figures, although these were soon mingled with heraldry and other Gothic motifs. Mudejar potters working under the rule of Christian nobles, such as the Luna and Boil families, gained a reputation in the Valencian towns of Manises and Paterna for this manufacturing style from the 14th-16th centuries, when the production was exported to Italy, Flanders and France. The Boil family fostered the ceramics industry in their fief of Manises, as it was one of their main sources of wealth. Pere Boil, who travelled to Granada as King James II's ambassador to the Nasrid court, is likely to have attracted Muslim potters from Malaga and encouraged them to settle down in Manises and other neighbouring villages to produce lusterware pottery. The ensuing success of Manises ranged from early imitation of Malaga models to a more commercially orientated production which left Malaga as a minority and exclusive market<sup>18</sup>.

## TECHNOLOGY AND INNOVATION IN ARCHITECTURE

Shared technologies are a particular case study showing intense interchange of knowledge between Muslims and Christians. Rammed earth (*tapia*) building is an interesting example. A *tapia* mixture with its aggregate and binding agent is similar to concrete when poured and rammed into wooden formworks. Both Muslims and Christians employed rammed earth to construct fortification walls because it was quick and easy. It was also widely used in Al-Andalus for houses, palaces and mosques, where Muslim architects employed inexpensive wall constructions and then finished them with ornate wood or stucco. The fact that the Romance term *tapia* passed into Arabic usage (*tabiya*) does not in this case warrant the conclusion that the technique was diffused from the Christian north to Al-Andalus. The opposite assumption that *tapia* was an Islamic technique which in eastern and southern Spain could compete with masonry construction is not clearly justified either, as Glick writes<sup>19</sup>. Both cultures appear to have employed a range of simple wall-building methods, dictated by the availability of alternative sources of construction materials. Rammed earth walls present variations related to the formwork measures, the types and materials used in the joints, as well as the

material itself and the binding agent<sup>20</sup>. When stone or wood were not easily available, Christians and Muslims could use *tapia* or bricks as a building commodity<sup>21</sup>. Even in the early modern period, rammed earth continued to be an efficient building technique for fortifications and other uses despite prejudices<sup>22</sup>.

Timbrel vaults are another controversial issue. Timbrel vaults consist of a series of low arches made of plain bricks laid lengthwise over a wood form (centring), making a much gentler curve, and also a lighter and more resistant structure than has generally been produced by other methods of construction. The Valencian rather than Catalan origin of this technique is documented from 1382 but it could be a result of knowledge transfer between Muslim and Christian architects in late medieval Spain. It is significant that the earliest documented timbrel vaults all appeared in the context of appropriation of Islamic techniques and decor from the late 14th century in the court of King Martin I of Aragon (1396-1410) in Valencia and Barcelona<sup>23</sup>.

Lavishly decorated and gilded wooden ceilings, made up of intricate geometric forms, have traditionally been classified as an Islamic influence on Spanish architecture. Travelers appreciated them as a peculiar trait of Spanish palaces and royal residences, making them distinctively different from other wooden ceilings which were common in most European countries<sup>24</sup>. Moreover, we know that some of the carpenters who created rich examples of these wooden ceilings were Muslims and most of the technical terms still in use to describe the elements of these ceilings and their decoration have Arab origins. However, not all the carpenters were Muslims or Mudejar<sup>25</sup>. This could be another case of shared technology which became a field of expertise for Spanish carpenters and at the same time a distinctive feature of royal and luxurious residences in late medieval and Renaissance Spain. Saint Mary's Church, built soon after the Christian conquest of Liria (Valencia) on the site of the old mosque, had a painted wooden ceiling made by a significant number of Mudejar workers<sup>26</sup>. It is hardly surprising that the splendid wooden ceiling in the throne room in the Aljaferia (royal residence in Zaragoza) included a triumphal inscription commemorating the final victory against the Muslim foe in 1492, even though it was the work of Mudejar carpenters, such as Faraig and Muhammad Gali<sup>27</sup>.

## PATTERNS OF INTENTION:

### ARCHITECTURAL STANDARDS OF ASSIMILATION AND DISMISSAL

Historians can establish different standards of assimilation in Iberian architecture apart from building techniques, which shared architects and patrons in Christian kingdoms or in Al-Andalus: form, space, function and ideology were readily transferred within a process of cultural exchange. These distinctions prove to be more reasoned than the distorted view of Mudejar style as a commonplace in interpreting artistic and architectural exchange between Christian kingdoms and Islamic Spain. It is much more important

to explore the purpose and combination in any given case study than the religion or ethnicity of the master builders, the materials employed in a building or the precise origin of a certain technique or functional plan of a civil building<sup>28</sup>. An interesting case is that of the monastery of Santa Clara in Tordesillas (Valladolid), an important palace built in the 1350s by order of Peter I of Castile as the likely and immediate predecessor of the renowned Court of Lions in the Alhambra of Granada. Ruiz Souza has shown that the same pattern may well have been taken from Tordesillas to Granada by the same artists who worked for both kingdoms, due to the close friendship between Peter I and Mohammad V<sup>29</sup>. Other authors have insisted on the common thread linking artists and forms between the Alcazar of Seville in the times of Peter I and the Alhambra. This could also be due to Peter I's preference for Mudejar over Gothic architecture because of its non-French associations<sup>30</sup>. Inscriptions and documents attest the will of Christian kings to have their sovereignty accepted by Christian, Jews and Muslims, even if the price to pay was respect for different religions among their subjects and the occasional occurrence of conflicts between Christians and Jews (1391) or Christians and Muslims (Mudejar revolts, and Morisco uprisings in the 16th century).

Enduring admiration for Islamic architectural monuments is widely recorded in Spanish medieval and early modern sources. Christian buildings assimilated their architectural and decorative forms from the 13th-14th centuries and adapted them to their new functions, including religious ones. Mosques and palaces were a sumptuous part of the booty acquired through the conquest and two attitudes were taken in dealing with them<sup>31</sup>. On one hand, in Castile Christian kings took on this legacy as a trophy and a treasure, easily adapted to new interests and beliefs and which continued to inspire admiration which has lasted up to present times, as is the case of the Alhambra or the great mosque in Córdoba. Alternatively, in other lands, such as Valencia or Majorca, which were conquered in the mid 13th century by James I, the choice was to cancel out the memories of enduring Islamic rule by replacing Muslim mosques and palaces with new unmistakably Christian ones, even if continuity in names, functions and customs was acceptable to a certain extent. Therefore, in the kingdoms of Majorca and Valencia, virtually no Islamic monument was preserved and our knowledge of Muslim architecture in these lands must rely primarily on archaeological excavations and indirect sources<sup>32</sup>. This attitude was not exclusive: in Valencia, public baths, inspired by the model of *hammâm* [Arab steam bath] whose attribution to the Islamic period has been taken for granted, were actually built after the Christian conquest and one example is still preserved in the so-called *baños del Almirante*<sup>33</sup>. In Xàtiva the mosque was preserved and used as a Christian church for centuries before the final decision to substitute it with a new temple was taken in 1596. Even then, early modern authors praised the splendour of the building in spite of its Arabic inscriptions and the memory of it as a religious site for local Moriscos<sup>34</sup>. Sources attest to the contribution of Mudejar workers in the construction of all kind of buildings, but this scarcely derived from a clear Islamic influence

in public or private architecture. Highly influential Christian authors, such as Francesc Eiximenis (circa 1330-1409) showed a dismissive attitude towards the Islamic legacy in town planning and architecture; such an attitude is also evident in the measures adopted by the council of Valencia against “Moorish walls”, houses or dead-end streets, considering all these elements as an unforgettable footprint of Muslim dominion<sup>35</sup>.

### *SPOLIA*: TROPHIES, MEMORY AND ASSIMILATION

According to Kinney, *spolia* are materials and artefacts in reuse, but art historians widely consider *spolia* as any artefacts incorporated into a setting culturally or chronologically different from that of its creation. They refer to certain uses of this kind of artefacts, since *spolia* can be a simple response to technological or resource limitations. More interesting is the reuse of culturally specific objects for less practical purposes, such as ornaments, especially when the *spolia* seem to contradict the message or purpose of their new setting<sup>36</sup>. Considered as art objects full of history or aggregates made up of different historic remains, *spolia* were “artistic statements expressing a triumph of the whole over its own component parts, the present over its varied past”<sup>37</sup>. In architecture, reuse can be prompted by a lack of a material, such as marble, but the way in which *spolia* are integrated and displayed enables us to interpret the potential cultural values behind this practice<sup>38</sup>.

The reuse of ancient Roman columns and inscriptions or early Christian altars and sarcophagi in medieval Valencian monuments hints at a will to reaffirm the Christian tradition that could legitimise the conquest of James I of Aragon: this was the case in Saint Felix’s church in Xàtiva<sup>39</sup>. The emplacement of two Islamic marble columns flanking the triumphal arch of the church of San Juan del Hospital in Valencia suggests an interest in exhibiting these trophies in one of the first Christian churches built in the city after it was taken in 1238<sup>40</sup>. Alternatively, the use of Islamic capitals and marble reliefs in the *Real* palace (the royal residence of Aragonese kings in Valencia) and their subsequent spoliation by King Peter I of Castile responds largely to genuine re-use of a scarce and luxurious material and thus as a trophy that Peter brought to his own palace in Seville<sup>41</sup>.

Islamic caskets entered Spanish church treasures as undoubtedly true *spolia* in the sense of trophies as part of the booty of the Christian Reconquest<sup>42</sup>. Attributes of power and dominion, such as crowns and thrones, as well as banners, arms and armour with royal insignia, were probably the most celebrated trophies, with the banner of the battle of Las Navas de Tolosa being one of the most renowned<sup>43</sup>. Nevertheless, after having surveyed objects of this kind comprehensively, Shalem thinks that the idea of trophy is far too restrictive a label for Islamic treasury objects, since they were also gifts, luxurious commodities and souvenirs<sup>44</sup>. While in the rest of medieval Europe Islamic works enjoyed the aura of exotic objects from the East, in Spain almost every looted object was regarded by the Christians as a further symbol of the liberation of the Iberian Pen-

insula<sup>45</sup>. These objects were lavishly decorated with carvings, coloured and sometimes even set with gems, caskets and *pyxides* [small lidded containers] and were one of the most valuable presents for a member of a royal family in Al-Andalus, but they became symbols of triumph over the Islamic enemy as soon as they passed to Christian hands. They were presented to churches as trophies of war against the infidels and were consequently Christianised by converting them into relic containers, and were sometimes even related to the memory of martyrs of the faith who had finally defeated the Muslim foe, as was probably the case of the ivory casket from the monastery of Leire (Navarre). The ivory *pyxis* still preserved in Saint Just Cathedral was probably part of the booty obtained by the archbishop of Narbonne after the conquest of Valencia<sup>46</sup>. In other cases, we are facing a historic aggregate: an ivory casket now preserved at the Royal Academy of History in Madrid which features a royal coat of arms from Aragon-Sicily was used as a relic container in the Valldecrist charterhouse, near Altura (Castellón). Although the original object was probably made in Fatimid Egypt, it came to Sicily, where it was adapted for the requirements of King Martin I (1356-1410), who offered it in turn for the treasure of the monastery of Valldecrist<sup>47</sup>. If we recognise some Nasrid influences in such a precious casket (dated in its present form in late 14th century), we should conclude that it constitutes the finest example of portability in the sense defined by Hoffman for previous periods: “While portability destabilised and dislocated works from their original sites of production, it also re-mapped geographical and cultural boundaries, opening up vistas of intra- and cross-cultural encounters and interactions”<sup>48</sup>.

Muslims, in turn, appropriated Christian *spolia* as trophies of their victories and converted them to new uses, sometimes with a prominently religious significance. The raids of Al-Mansur against Santiago de Compostela turned to Córdoba, with the bells of churches as booty carried by Christian prisoners, and bell towers were one of the first symbols of the Christian dominion established after the conquest. Muslim diplomat and poet Ibn-al-Abbar lamented the fall of Valencia in 1238, remarking how bells summoned Christians to churches from the same towers where the muezzin used to call the faithful to pray at the mosques<sup>49</sup>. It is hardly surprising that some bells were taken as trophies and transformed into lamps to hang in Muslim mosques such as Qarawiyyin in Fez where their appearance was changed, their original use was altered and they were made into valuable objects at the service of a different religion in the context of a competition between bell towers and minarets<sup>50</sup>.

## A SENSE OF LOSS

Christian and Muslim writers alike have built up the concept of the Golden Age in Muslim Spain. The nostalgic tone of the literature of exile, be it by Arab or Jewish authors, has not been the sole element to foster this myth. Modern Muslims’ pride in the artistic and cultural splendours in the West, represented by the golden age of Al-

Andalus, has also played a role in proclaiming the once clear superiority of Islam over the Western world. The material remains of that period happen to serve as places of memory and nostalgia for Muslims everywhere.

The tendency to glorify Muslim Spain by creating an imagined medieval story for this region can be considered as part of the exorcising of Islam from the history of Europe and forging a Christian Spanish collective identity<sup>51</sup>. The inclusion of *Andalusi* art in nationalistic art history narratives tends to emphasise its influence on Christian art and it serves to explain certain Spanish peculiarities against more common European tendencies<sup>52</sup>. The ancient boundary between Christians and Muslims in a period of coexistence and cultural interchange has been transformed into a new limit to reshape Spanish identity in a European context. Assimilation of *Andalusis* was part of the building up of a national history in Spain, while other processes of coexistence and acculturation in Europe, namely in Sicily, Malta or the Balkans, were not taken into account<sup>53</sup>. Trophies or treasures, ivory caskets, luxurious textiles and magnificent monuments still preserve an aura of splendour that proves the value of those who conquered them. In the same way as these artefacts and buildings were Christianised in the Middle Ages, they were assimilated as part of a Spanish heritage, Christian and tolerant to a certain extent, which accounted for a different history and explanation of a specific cultural identity in a European context<sup>54</sup>. The romantic and exotic visions of Washington Irving (*Tales of the Alhambra*, 1832) or José Amador de los Ríos, who proposed the term Mudejar in a famous lecture given in 1859 to define the assimilation of Islamic aesthetics in Spanish architecture<sup>55</sup>, have been replaced by new ideals of tolerance and cross-cultural dialogue in contemporary Spain, but this is one of the last links in a chain of successive assimilation of an embarrassing legacy and a luxurious booty.

## NOTES

- <sup>1</sup> J. Bloom, S. Blair, *Islamic Arts*, London 1997.
- <sup>2</sup> R. Ousterhout, D.F. Ruggles, *Encounters with Islam: The Medieval Mediterranean Experience. Art, Material Culture, and Cultural Interchange*, in "Gesta", 2004, 43, 2, pp. 83-85.
- <sup>3</sup> A. MacKay, *Spain in the Middle Ages: from Frontier to Empire, 1000-1500*, London 1977; T.F. Glick, *Islamic and Christian Spain in the Early Middle Ages: Comparative Perspectives on Social and Cultural Formation*, Princeton 1979; B.F. Reilly, *The Medieval Spains*, Cambridge 1993; R. Fletcher, *Moorish Spain*, Berkeley 1992 for a historical overview.
- <sup>4</sup> A. Castro, *España en su historia: cristianos, moros y judíos*, Buenos Aires 1948; C. Sánchez Albornoz, *España, un enigma histórico*, Buenos Aires 1956.
- <sup>5</sup> On Mudejar and Moriscos minorities and their cultural interface with Christians in the kingdom of Valencia, see R.I. Burns, *Medieval Colonialism: Postcrusade Exploitation of Islamic Valencia*, Princeton 1975; J. Boswell, *The Royal Treasure: Muslim Communities under the Crown of Aragon in the Fourteenth Century*, New Haven 1977; M.T. Ferrer i Mallol, *La frontera amb l'Islam en el segle XIV. Cristians i sarraïns al País Valencià*, Barcelona 1988; M.D. Meyerson, *The Muslims of Valencia in the Age of Fernando and Isabel: Between Coexistence and Crusade*, Berkeley 1991; Id., *Un reino de contradicciones: Valencia*,

- 1391-1526, in "Revista d'Història Medieval", 2001-2002, 12, pp. 11-30; B. Ehlers, *Between Christian and Moriscos: Juan de Ribera and Religious Reform in Valencia (1568-1614)*, Baltimore 2006.
- <sup>6</sup> Glick, *Islamic and Christian Spain* cit., p. 3.
- <sup>7</sup> G.M. Borrás Gualis, *El arte mudéjar*, Teruel 1990; R. López Guzmán, *Arquitectura mudéjar*, Madrid 2000; M.E. Díez Jorge, *El arte mudéjar: expresión artística de una convivencia*, Granada 2001.
- <sup>8</sup> J.D. Dodds, M.R. Menocal, A.K. Balbale, *The Arts of Intimacy*, New Haven - London 2008, pp. 323-329.
- <sup>9</sup> Burns, *Medieval Colonialism* cit., p. 10. No scholar has attempted a systematic survey of Mudejar art in the territory of the medieval kingdom of Valencia.
- <sup>10</sup> B.R. Gampel, *Jews, Christians, and Muslims in Medieval Iberia: Convivencia through the Eyes of Sephardic Jews*, in V.B. Mann, T.F. Glick, J.D. Dodds (eds.), *Convivencia. Jews, Muslims and Christians in Medieval Spain*, New York 1992, pp. 11-37 with annotated bibliography.
- <sup>11</sup> J.C. Ruiz Souza, *Sinagogas sefardíes monumentales em el contexto de la arquitectura medieval hispana*, in I. Bango Torviso (ed.), *Memoria de Sefarad*, Madrid 2002, pp. 229-232.
- <sup>12</sup> T.F. Glick, *Science in Medieval Spain: The Jewish Contribution in the Context of Convivencia*, in Mann, Glick, Dodds, *Convivencia* cit., pp. 83-111.
- <sup>13</sup> J.D. Dodds, *Architecture and Ideology in Early Medieval Spain*, London - Philadelphia 1990, I.G. Bango, *Arte prerrománico hispano. El arte en la España cristiana de los siglos VI al XI*, Madrid 2001, pp. 170-226. See also J.D. Dodds, C. Little, J. Williams (eds.), *The Art of Medieval Spain A.D. 500-1200*, New York 1993.
- <sup>14</sup> J. Vernet, *Lo que Europa debe al Islam de España*, Barcelona 2000; Glick, *Islamic Art and Christian Spain* cit.
- <sup>15</sup> R.I. Burns, *Islam under the Crusaders*, Princeton 1973, pp. 90-96.
- <sup>16</sup> Glick, *Islamic Art and Christian Spain* cit., pp. 222-223.
- <sup>17</sup> Literally *cum opera sarracenicis* and *cum literis arabis lividis coloris*. See Burns, *Islam* cit., p. 92.
- <sup>18</sup> J. Coll Conesa, *Transferencias técnicas en la producción cerámica entre Al-Andalus y los reinos cristianos: el caso de Sharq-al-Andalus*, in A. Malpica (ed.), *Cerámicas islámicas y cristianas a fines de la Edad Media. Influencias e intercambios*, Ceuta 2003, pp. 301-365; J. Coll Conesa, *La loza decorada en España*, in "Ars Longa", 2008, 17, pp. 151-168; A. García Porras, *La cerámica en azul y dorado valenciana del siglo XIV e inicios del siglo XV*, Valencia 2009.
- <sup>19</sup> Glick, *Islamic and Christian Spain*, cit., pp. 224-225.
- <sup>20</sup> A. Serra Desfilis, *Tapial y adobe: fábricas de tierra cruda en la historia de la arquitectura medieval hispana*, in M. Achenza, M. Cadinu, M. Correia, A. Serra (eds.), *Houses and cities built with Earth: Conservation, significance and urban quality*, Lisbon 2006, pp. 72-76.
- <sup>21</sup> P. Araguan, *Brique et architecture dans l'Espagne médiévale (XIIe-XVe siècles)*, Madrid 2003.
- <sup>22</sup> L. Arciniega García, *Prejuicios historiográficos sobre la técnica del tapial de tierra en la España de la Edad Moderna*, in Achenza, Cadinu, Correia, Serra (eds.), *Houses and cities* cit., pp. 78-79.
- <sup>23</sup> Araguan, *Brique*, cit.; M. Gómez-Ferrer, *Las bóvedas tabicadas en la arquitectura valenciana durante los siglos XIV, XV y XVI*, in E. Mira, A. Saragozza (eds.), *Una arquitectura gótica mediterránea*, Valencia 2003, vol. 2, pp. 133-156; M. Carbonell i Buades, *De Marc Safont a Antoni Carbonell: la pervivencia de la arquitectura gótica en Cataluña*, in M.I. Álvaro Zámora, J. Ibáñez Fernández (eds.), *La arquitectura de la Corona de Aragón entre el Gótico y el Renacimiento*, Zaragoza 2009, pp. 97-148, especialmente pp. 111-113.
- <sup>24</sup> For instance, the German traveller Hieronymus Münzer in his *Itinerarium sive peregrinatio excellentissimi viri artium ac vtriusque medicine doctoris Hieronimi Monetarii de Feltkirchen ciuis Nurembergensis* (1494-1495).
- <sup>25</sup> E. Nuere, *Geometría y lazo en la carpintería hispano-musulmana*, in *La arquitectura como diversidad*, Zaragoza 1998, pp. 47-76.

- <sup>26</sup> J.A. Llibrer Escrig, *El finestral gòtic. L'església i el poble de Lliria als segles medievals*, Lliria 2003, pp. 290-309.
- <sup>27</sup> The inscription reads: "*Ferdinandus, Hispaniarum, Siciliae, Corsicae, Balearumque rex, principum optimus, prudens, strenuus, pius, constans, iustus, felix, et Helisabeth regina, religione et animi magnitudine supra mulierem, insigni coniuges, auxiliante Christo, victoriosissimi, post liberatam a mauris Bethycam, pulso veteri feroque hoste, hoc opus construendum curarunt, anno salutis MCCCCLXXXII*". See B. Cabañero Subiza, G. Borrás Gualis, *La Aljafaría*, Zaragoza 1998.
- <sup>28</sup> J.C. Ruiz Souza, *Architectural languages, functions, and spaces: the Crown of Castile and Al-Andalus*, in "Medieval Encounters", 2006, 12/3, pp. 460-367; Id., *Le 'style mudéjar' en architecture cent cinquante ans après*, in "Perspectiva", 2009, 2, pp. 277-286.
- <sup>29</sup> Id., *El Patio del Vergel del Real monasterio de santa Clara de Tordesillas y la Alhambra de Granada. Reflexiones para su estudio*, in "Al-Qantara", 1998, 20, pp. 315-355.
- <sup>30</sup> D.F. Ruggles, *The Alcazar of Seville and Mudejar Architecture*, in "Gesta" 2002, 43, 2, pp. 87-98.
- <sup>31</sup> J.A. Harris, *Mosque to Church Conversions in the Spanish Reconquest*, "Medieval Encounters", 1997, 3, pp. 158-172.
- <sup>32</sup> M. Falomir Faus, *El proceso de cristianización urbana de la ciudad de Valencia durante el siglo XV*, in "Archivo Español de Arte", 1991, 254, pp. 127-139.
- <sup>33</sup> C. Camps, J. Torró, *Baños, hornos y pueblas. La pobla de Vila-rasa y la reordenación urbana de Valencia en el siglo XIV*, in F. Taberner (ed.), *Historia de la ciudad II: Territorio, sociedad y patrimonio*, Valencia 2002, pp. 126-146.
- <sup>34</sup> J. Bérchez, M. Gómez-Ferrer, *La Seo de Xàtiva. Historia, imágenes y realidades*, Valencia 2007, pp. 301-303.
- <sup>35</sup> Falomir, *El proceso* cit.; A. Serra Desfilis, *Orden y decorum en el urbanismo valenciano de los siglos XIV y XV*, in A. Casamento, E. Guidoni (eds.), *Le città medievali dell'Italia meridionale e insulare. Storia dell'urbanistica/Sicilia IV*, Rome 2004, pp. 41-42.
- <sup>36</sup> D. Kinney, *The Concept of Spolia*, in C. Rudolph (ed.), *A Companion to Medieval Art*, Oxford 2006, pp. 233-252.
- <sup>37</sup> I. Forsyth, *Art with History: The role of Spolia in the Cumulative Work of Art*, in C. Moss, K. Kiefer (eds.), *Byzantine East, Latin West. Art Historical Studies in Honor of Kurt Weitzmann*, Princeton 1995, p. 153.
- <sup>38</sup> J.F. Bernard, P. Bernardi, D. Esposito (eds.), *Il reimpiego in architettura. Recupero, trasformazione, uso*. Atti del convegno, Roma 8-10 November 2007, Rome 2008, pp. 7-26 with updated bibliography.
- <sup>39</sup> A. Serra Desfilis, *La arquitectura de época medieval en la gobernación de Xàtiva*, in Aliaga, Company, Pons (eds.), *La Llum de les Imatges* cit., pp. 329-349.
- <sup>40</sup> J.V. Lerma, P. Cressier, *Un nuevo caso de reaprovechamiento de capiteles califales en un monumento cristiano: la iglesia de San Juan del Hospital (Valencia)*, in "Cuadernos de Medinat al-Zahra", 1999, 4, pp. 133-143.
- <sup>41</sup> A. Serra Desfilis, *Cort e palau de Rey. The Real Palace of Valencia in the medieval ages*, in "Imago temporis. Medium Aevum", 2007, 1, p. 128.
- <sup>42</sup> J. Harris, *Muslim Ivories in Christian Hands: the Leire Casket in Context*, in "Art History", 1995, 18, pp. 213-221.
- <sup>43</sup> J. Dodds (ed.), *Al Andalus. The art of Islamic Spain, 711-1492*, New York 1992, pp. 326-327.
- <sup>44</sup> A. Shalem, *Islamic Christianized. Islamic Portable Objects in the Medieval Church Treasuries of the Latin West*, 2nd ed., Frankfurt am Main 1998.

- <sup>45</sup> A. Shalem, *From Royal Caskets to Relic Containers: Two Ivory Caskets from Burgos and Madrid*, in "Mujer", 1995, 12, pp. 24-38.
- <sup>46</sup> See *Ibid.*, p. 24, but this object is not well documented before 1857. See R. López Guzmán, A. Vallejo Triano (eds.), *El esplendor de los Omeyas cordobeses*, exhibition catalogue, Granada 2001, p. 254.
- <sup>47</sup> J.A. Eiroa Rodríguez, *Real Academia de la Historia. Antigüedades medievales*, Madrid 2006, pp. 43-45.
- <sup>48</sup> E.R. Hoffman, *Pathways of Portability: Islamic and Christian interchange from the tenth to the twelfth century*, in "Art History", 2001, 24/1, p. 17.
- <sup>49</sup> M. Mata, *Textos árabes referentes a Valencia en la recopilación de al-Himyarí*, in "Revista Valenciana de Filología", 1963-1966, 2, p. 179.
- <sup>50</sup> Dodds, Menocal, Balbale, *The Arts of Intimacy* cit., pp. 197-198.
- <sup>51</sup> B. Fuchs, *Exotic Nation: Maurophilia and the Construction of Early Modern Spain*, Philadelphia 2008.
- <sup>52</sup> F. Chueca Goitia, *Invariantes castizos de la arquitectura española*, Madrid - Buenos Aires 1947.
- <sup>53</sup> M. Fierro, *Idealización de al-Andalus*, in "Revista de libros", October 2004, 24, pp. 3-6.
- <sup>54</sup> M.R. Menocal, *The Ornament of the World. How Muslims, Jews and Christians created a Culture of Tolerant in Medieval Spain*, London 2002, and an opposite view by S. Fanjul, *La quimera de al-Andalus*, Madrid 2004, who rejects multi-cultural values of Al-Andalus as applicable to modern societies.
- <sup>55</sup> I. Henares Cuéllar, T. Raquejo, A. González Troyano, *La imagen romántica del legado andalusí*, exhibition catalogue, Barcelona 1995.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Achenza M., Cadinu M., Correia M., Serra A. (eds.), *Houses and cities built with Earth: Conservation, significance and urban quality*, Lisbon 2006.
- Araguas P., *Brique et architecture dans l'Espagne médiévale (XIIe-XVe siècle)*, Madrid 2003.
- Bango I.G., *Arte prerrománico hispano. El arte en la España cristiana de los siglos VI al XI*, Madrid 2001.
- Bango Torviso I.G. (ed.), *Memoria de Sefarad*, Madrid 2002.
- Bérchez J., Góme-Ferrer M., *La Seo de Xàtiva. Historia, imágenes y realidades*, Valencia 2007.
- Bernard J.F., Bernard P., Esposito D. (eds.), *Il reimpiego in architettura. Recupero, trasformazione, uso*. Atti del convegno, École Française de Rome, 8-10 2007, Rome 2008.
- Bloom J., Blair S., *Islamic Arts*, London 1997.
- Borrás Gualis G., *El arte mudéjar*, Teruel 1990.
- Boswell J., *The Royal Treasure: Muslim Communities under the Crown of Aragon in the Fourteenth Century*, New Haven CT 1977.
- Burns R.I., *Islam under the Crusaders: Colonial Survival in the Thirteenth-Century Kingdom of Valencia*, Princeton 1973.
- Id., *Medieval Colonialism. Postcrusade Exploitation of Islamic Valencia*, Princeton 1975.
- Cabañero Subiza B., Borrás Gualis G. (eds.), *La Aljafería*, Zaragoza 1998.
- Camps C., Torró J., *Baños, hornos y pueblos. La pobla de Vila-rasa y la reordenación urbana de Valencia en el siglo XIV*, in Taberner F. (ed.), *Historia de la ciudad II: Territorio, sociedad y patrimonio*, Valencia 2002, pp. 126-146.
- Carbonell Buades M., *De Marc Safont a Antoni Carbonell: la pervivencia de la arquitectura gótica en Cataluña*, in Álvaro Zámora M.I., Ibáñez Fernández J. (eds.), *La arquitectura de la Corona de Aragón entre el Gótico y el Renacimiento*, Zaragoza 2009, pp. 97-14.

- Castro A., *España en su historia: cristianos, moros y judíos*, Buenos Aires 1948.
- Chueca Goitia F., *Invariantes castizos de la arquitectura española*, Madrid - Buenos Aires 1947.
- Coll Conesa J., *Transferencias técnicas en la producción cerámica entre Al-Andalus y los reinos cristianos: el caso de Sharq-al-Andalus*, in Malpica A. (ed.), *Cerámicas islámicas y cristianas a fines de la Edad Media. Influencias e intercambios*, Ceuta 2003, pp. 301-365.
- Díez Jorge M.E., *El arte mudéjar: expresión estética de una convivencia*, Granada 2001.
- Dodds J., *Architecture and Ideology of Early Medieval Spain*, London - Philadelphia 1990.
- Id. (ed.), *Al Andalus. The art of Islamic Spain, 711-1492*, New York 1992.
- Dodds J. D., Little C., Williams J. (eds.), *The Art of Medieval Spain A.D. 500-1200*, New York 1993.
- Dodds J., Menocal M.R., Balbale A.K., *The Arts of Intimacy: Christians, Jews and Muslims in the Making of Castilian Culture*, New Haven - London 2008.
- Dodds J., Glick T.F., Mann V.B., *Convivencia: Jews, Muslims and Christians in Medieval Spain*, New York 2007.
- Ehlers B., *Between Christian and Moriscos: Juan de Ribera and Religious Reform in Valencia (1568-1614)*, Baltimore 2006.
- Eiroa Rodríguez, J.A., *Real Academia de la Historia. Antigüedades medievales*, Madrid 2006.
- Fanjul S., *La quimera de al-Andalus*, Madrid 2004.
- Ferrer i Mallol, M.T., *La frontera amb l'Islam en el segle XIV. Cristians i sarraïns al País Valencià*, Barcelona 1988.
- Fierro M., *Idealización de al-Andalus*, in "Revista de libros", October 2004, 24, pp. 3-6.
- Forsyth I., *Art with History: The Role of Spolia in the Cumulative Work of Art*, in Moss C., Kiefer K. (eds.), *Byzantine East, Latin West. Art Historical Studies in Honor of Kurt Weitzmann*, Princeton 1995, pp. 153-162.
- Fuchs B., *Exotic Nation: Maurophilia and the Construction of Early Modern Spain*, Philadelphia 2008.
- García Porras A., *La cerámica en azul y dorado valenciana del siglo XIV e inicios del siglo XV*, Valencia 2009.
- Glick T.F., *Islamic and Christian Spain in the Early Middle Ages, Comparative Perspectives on Social and Cultural Formation*, Princeton 1979; 2nd revised ed., Leiden 2005.
- Gómez-Ferrer M., *Las bóvedas tabicadas en la arquitectura valenciana durante los siglos XIV, XV y XVI*, in Mira E., Zaragoza A. (eds.), *Una arquitectura gótica mediterránea*, Valencia 2003, vol. 2, pp. 133-156.
- Harris J., *Muslim Ivories in Christian Hands: the Leire Casket in Context*, in "Art History", 1995, 18, pp. 213-221.
- Id., *Mosque to Church Conversions in the Spanish Reconquest*, in "Medieval Encounters", 1997, 3, pp. 158-172.
- Henares Cuéllar I., Raquejo T., González Troyano, A. (eds.), *La imagen romántica del legado andalusí*, Barcelona 1995.
- Hoffman E.R., *Pathways of Portability: Islamic and Christian interchange from the tenth to the twelfth century*, in "Art History", 2001, 24, 1, pp. 17-50.
- Kinney D., *The Concept of Spolia*, in Rudolph C. (ed.), *A Companion to Medieval Art*, Oxford 2006, pp. 233-252.
- Jerma J.V., Cressier P., *Un nuevo caso de reaprovechamiento de capiteles califales en un monumento cristiano: la iglesia de San Juan del Hospital (Valencia)*, in "Cuadernos de Medinat al-Zahra", 1999, 4, pp. 133-143.
- Llibrer Escrig J.A., *El finestrall gòtic. L'església i el poble de Llíria als segles medievals*, Llíria 2003.
- López Guzmán R., Vallejo Triano, A. (eds.), *El esplendor de los Omeyyas cordobeses*, Granada 2001.

- López Guzmán R. (ed.), *Arquitectura mudéjar*, Madrid 2000.
- Mata M., *Textos árabes referentes a Valencia en la recopilación de al-Himyarí*, in "Revista Valenciana de Filología", 1963-1966, 2, pp. 177-183.
- Menocal M.R., *The Ornament of the World. How Muslims, Jews and Christians Created a Culture of Tolerance in Medieval Spain*, Boston - London 2002.
- Meyerson M.D., *The Muslims of Valencia in the Age of Fernando and Isabel: Between Coexistence and Crusade*, Berkeley 1991.
- Id., *Un reino de contradicciones: Valencia, 1391-1526*, in "Revista d'Història Medieval", 2001-2002, 12, pp. 11-30.
- Nuere Matauco E., *Geometría y lazo en la carpintería hispano-musulmana*, in *La arquitectura como diversidad*, Zaragoza 1998: pp. 47-76.
- Ousterhout R., Ruggles D.F., *Encounters with Islam: The Medieval Mediterranean Experience. Art, Material Culture, and Cultural Interchange*, in "Gesta", 2004, 43/2, pp. 83-85.
- Ruggles D.F., *The Alcazar of Seville and Mudejar Architecture*, in "Gesta", 2002, 43/2, pp. 87-98.
- Ruiz Souza J.C., *El Patio del Vergel del Real monasterio de santa Clara de Tordesillas y la Alhambra de Granada. Reflexiones para su estudio*, in "Al-Qantara", 1998, 20, pp. 315-355.
- Id., *Castilla y al-Andalus. Arquitecturas aljamiadas y otros grados de asimilación*, in "Anuario del Departamento de Historia y Teoría del Arte", 2004, 16, pp. 17-43.
- Id., *Architectural languages, functions, and spaces: the Crown of Castile and Al-Andalus*, in "Medieval Encounters", 2006, 12/3, pp. 460-367.
- Id., *Le 'style mudéjar' en architecture cent cinquante ans après*, in "Perspectiva", 2009, 2, pp. 277-286.
- Sánchez Albornoz C., *España, un enigma histórico*, Buenos Aires 1956.
- Serra Desfilis A., *Orden y decorum en el urbanismo valenciano de los siglos XIV y XV*, in Casamento A., Guidoni E. (eds.), *Le città medievali dell'Italia meridionale e insulare. Storia dell'urbanistica/Sicilia IV*, Atti del convegno di Palermo - Palazzo Chiaromonte (Steri), 28-29 November 2002, Rome 2004, pp. 37-50.
- Id., *La arquitectura de época medieval en la gobernación de Xàtiva*, in Aliaga J., Company X., Pons V. (eds.), *La Llum de les Imatges. Lux Mundi. Xàtiva 2007. Libro de estudios*, Valencia 2007, pp. 329-349.
- Id., *Cort e palau de Rey. The Real Palace of Valencia in the medieval ages*, in "Imago temporis. Medium Aevum", 2007, 1, pp. 121-148.
- Shalem A., *From Royal Caskets to Relic Containers: Two Ivory Caskets from Burgos and Madrid*, in "Muqarnas", 1995, 12, pp. 24-38.
- Id., *Islam Christianized: Islamic Portable Objects in the Medieval Church Treasuries of the Latin West*, Frankfurt am Main 1996.
- Vernet J., *Lo que Europa debe al Islam de España*, Barcelona 2000.

